

# Climate Impact Advisory Committee



Meeting Minutes

Date: September 2nd 2021

Location: Zoom

QUORUM	Y
<b>Members Present</b>	
William Bethel	x
Ginny Broadhurst	x
Kaylee Galloway	x
Sue Gunn	x
Steve Harrell	x
David Kershner	x
Katherine Kissinger	x
Ellyn Murphy	x
Imran Sheikh	x
Phil Thompson	x
Eddy Ury	x
STAFF Chris Elder	x

## 1) Call to Order/Roll Call

Meeting Started at 5:33pm

## 2) Review and approval of Minutes from August

**Ellyn** made a small suggestion for the minutes regarding commas on page 2.

**Phil** motioned to approve the minutes

**Sue** Seconded

## 3) Public Comment

Public in attendance

**Jack Wellman**, PSE

**Mark Buford**

**Jon Oesting**

## 4) Final summary of 30-Day Public Review Process – Dave, William and Eddy

Some more comments came in before the end of the month that were not included in the totals last meeting.

The final numbers are:

*149 comments*

*145 in support*

*62 offered suggestions*

*19 on the Built Environment*

*22 on the Natural Environment*

*8 about public health*

*15 classified as other, not falling into the above categories*

The City of Bellingham sent in some detailed comments, **Dave** offered to send them out to the committee

Dave said that he is compiling all the comments into a pdf to be posted on the CIAC website for people to reference. **Dave** said this would be an alternative to providing all the comments in an appendix of the CAP.

**Phil** commented that **Seth Vidana** climate manager for Bellingham has commented several times throughout the process of writing the CAP and that some of them have already been addressed by some of the Chapter authors.

**Ellyn** said that having the comments on the website makes more sense than listing them all in the CAP appendix. She suggested that **Dave** work on a write up on the public comment review process to add into the CAP.

## **5) CAP Chapter Leads: reviewer tables; responses to public review; deadline for edits – Ellyn**

Edits to the reviewer tables:

**Ellyn** reviewed the tables of editors for specific sections

**Eddy Ury in Zoom Chat:** I think there's a typo in **Carryn's** last name

**Chris Elder in Zoom Chat:** Correct, **Carryn VandeGriend**

**Jack Wellman – PSE in Zoom Chat:** There's a space between "**Vande**" and "**Griend**"

**Phil** said that some people who helped out reviewing transportation weren't formal reviewers but did make substantial comments

**Ellyn** said she could add them

**Kaylee** suggested making sure the wording is consistent throughout the table to give everyone appropriate credit

**Chris** said that **Larry Davis** from the conservation district may have contributed comments for the agriculture section.

**Steve** said he didn't receive those comments

**Ellyn** said she would check his comments to see how substantial they were and update the list accordingly

**Ellyn** asked about **Stephen Nyman** for the Ecosystems chapter.

**Chris** said that he is on the Wildlife advisory committee.

**Ellyn** Mentioned there will be a cover letter from **Exec. Sidhu**

- The list of acronyms has also been updated to more accurately reflect the ones used in the CAP

- The definitions of goals, strategies, and actions have been updated in the executive summary
- The IPCC 6 has been mentioned in the CAP as well.
- State energy strategy transitioning from our state exporting energy to importing renewables by 2050.
- The Strategy/ Action/ Benefit tables moved to end of chapters
- consistent wording in strategies in the text and tables

Responses from Chapter authors edits in response to public comments:

**Phil – Transportation:** responded to the earlier comments from **Seth Vidana** & City of Bellingham Transportation Planner **Chris Cuomeau**

**Sue – Industry:** No comments

**Waste:** No Comments

**Kaylee – Land Use:** incorporating more of the Vulnerability Assessments into land use, ReSources recommendation to enhance ecosystem services section, Whatcom Million Trees recommendation about canopy and forest resources. These were incorporated where applicable throughout the chapter

**Chris – Natural Resources:** still working, Mentioned the ReSources comments.

**Katie – Ecosystems:** **Katie** asked to have the ReSources letter re-sent. And that she was still working on edits to the Chapter. She received some comments forwarded from **Ellyn** and **Dave**.

**Steve – Implementation:** Some paragraphs have been added from the comments in collaboration with the County and COB.

Presentation on Marginal Abatement Cost Curves for US Net- Zero Energy Systems:

This would be a suggestion of something to add into the report since there have been many public comments that have asked about cost.

*Marginal Abatement Cost:* the cost per unit of GHG emissions abated throughout the lifetime of the project. Marginal cost is commonly referred to as \$/ton of CO<sub>2</sub>e abated.

The proposal is to add a Marginal Abatement Cost Curve graphic into the CAP

CIAC did not calculate this because we lacked both the expertise and the necessary data for Whatcom County.

In the CAP we will encourage the OCA to work on producing a Marginal Abatement Cost Analysis specific to Whatcom County.

**Imran Sheikh in Zoom Chat:** Patrick Shive did a MAC for Bellingham as part of his Masters project last year: <https://cedar.wvu.edu/wwuet/973/>

**Ginny Broadhurst in Zoom Chat:** thanks Imran

**Imran Sheikh in Zoom Chat:**

[https://www.edf.org/sites/default/files/documents/MACC\\_2.0%20report\\_Evolved\\_EDF.pdf](https://www.edf.org/sites/default/files/documents/MACC_2.0%20report_Evolved_EDF.pdf)

**Phil Thompson in Zoom Chat:** thanks, Imran

**Jon Oesting in Zoom Chat:** Instead of complex cost analysis steps, give them a list: Do this first. Unless you have the real data, you will find yourself caught in debating the details. 1st thing to do with a local emphasis? 1st nationally might be good but what's good for us right now? In our local climate, the crudest method is called payback time. "I save 200/mo. and it takes me 5 years to recover the cost."

Many of our recommendations in the CAP have been on track with the targets in the State Energy Strategy

**Phil** said that it doesn't seem like we would be in a position to do anything too detailed but perhaps we could suggest priorities without going into too much detail. He agreed that the MAC is a good priority to have for the OCA Data Analyst.

**Ellyn** said that she is not suggesting we add any numbers in the CAP ourselves but more to add this as a suggestion to the County to work on.

**Steve** said that the suggestion of this analysis be added to the implementation section as a way that the county can use to determine what to prioritize. Steve also suggested that he could draft something up for the implementation section about this.

**Dave** said that if we are going to recommend MAC that we should also include a discussion of the limitations associated with this type of analysis

**Ellyn** said that she wasn't aware of this type of analysis being used for natural systems.

**Dave** said that the King County plan did include some natural systems in their MAC.

**Ellyn** Asked Dave to send Steve a paragraph on that for the implementation section.

**Phil** said that one limitation of a MAC is that it doesn't accurately capture all the other benefits of these strategies. For example, health benefits may be overlooked.

**Ellyn** asked **Imran** for some comments.

**Imran** referenced his chat comment with the link to a MAC for Bellingham done by a grad student. And that the biggest issue he sees with this is getting the data to work with.

**Steve** said that deciding which data to use is also a challenge with this.

Discussion on Implementation Strategies, Publicity for the Whatcom County CAP

Articles have been published in the *Bellingham Herald*, *Salish Current*, and *Cascadia Weekly* so far.

Upcoming articles will be published in the *Lynden Tribune*, *The Northern Light*, *The Planet* and, *The Front*.

**Sue** suggested putting together a panel at the City Club

**Steve** agreed that was a great Idea

**Chris** suggested social media

**Steve** asked if any of the younger members may be able to help with social media strategies?

**Katie Kissinger in Zoom Chat:** I can help with Social Media posts

**Stevan Harrell in Zoom Chat:** Thanks for the suggestions, and we'll follow up.

**William** also volunteered to help with social media

**Ellyn** gave a shout out to **Steve** for his work publicizing the CAP

**Kaylee Galloway in Zoom Chat:** Great job, Steve!!

**Ginny Broadhurst in Zoom Chat:** Nice work getting the word out Steve.

## **6) Process for presenting CAP to County Council – Chris**

From the last council meeting we received some comments from **Councilmember Donovan** But due to the time crunch of the meeting and being situated as the last agenda item, **Councilmembers Buchanan** and **Donovan** have suggested a work session meeting before the CAP is officially submitted.

The work session is to be held on *September 28<sup>th</sup>*

There will also be a meeting with **Executive Sidhu** on *September 15<sup>th</sup>*

The final CAP will be submitted in *October*

**Ellyn** said that she has set up appointments one on one with three council members **Donovan, Frazey,** and **Kershner** so far

**Kaylee** asked about the role of CIAC to reach out for public comments at the council meeting

**William** said that he has about 20 people who are willing to speak in support of the CAP

**Ellyn** asked if we should draft a resolution

**Chris** said it's not required but could be something good to make things clear.

**Ellyn** asked if public comment comes before the vote

**Chris** said yes

**Sue** suggested a city club panel in October to help mobilize people to show up and comment their support for the plan

**Chris** said that he has confidence that there is council support for the plan

**Jon Oesting in Zoom Chat:** Have we got an insider on the council that is "on board" with this?

**David Kershner in Zoom Chat:** Jon, I don't think we have an "insider" on the County Council, but **Council Chair Barry Buchanan** has raised no objections to the plan that I am aware of. He has also stated that we need to look at county government actions through a climate protection lens.

**Jon Oesting in Zoom Chat:** Are there advocates for this at Western and the Bell Schools? Tribes? Supporting the plans?

**David Kershner in Zoom Chat:** Jon, we definitely have supporters of the plan at Western, some of whom serve on the Climate Impact Advisory Committee. Representatives of the Lummi Nation and Nooksack Tribe have been commenting on drafts of the plan. Not sure if tribal governments will end up writing letters of support, but it is worth asking. Thank you.

**Ellyn** said that anyone on the committee is welcome to help with drafting the resolution

## **7) Fall/Winter Meeting Content - Ellyn**

- **Seth Vidana**, Bellingham climate action plan – October
- CIAC role going forward
- What information do people want?
- **Ginny**, State of the Salish Sea report
- **Eric Grossman**, sea level rise
- **Paula Harris**, floodplains

**Phil** asked what is our formal or informal line of communication with council and exec?

**Ellyn** suggested that committee members could write up steps for the council to take to complete the various action items in the CAP

**Steve** suggested at the October meeting to go around and ask committee members for ideas on what we should be doing going forward

**Ellyn** sharing new articles we find throughout the month with the committee

**Sue** asked about doing an inventory on what other cities have done in regards to climate plans and suggested each of us could report on a city

## **8) Adjourn**

Meeting ended at 7:08pm

**Next meeting scheduled for October 7th, 2021**

Recorded By: Katherine Kissinger

For edits contact [kissinger.katherine@gmail.com](mailto:kissinger.katherine@gmail.com)

County Staff contact: Chris Elder – [celder@co.whatcom.wa.us](mailto:celder@co.whatcom.wa.us)